Review
Reviewed Work(s): Bali 1928 I: Gamelan Gong Kebyar: Music from Belaluan, Pangkung, Busung-biu: The Oldest New Music of Bali by Allan Evans; Bali 1928 II: Tembang Kuna: Songs from an Earlier Time by Allan Evans; Bali 1928 III: Lotring and the Sources of Gamelan Tradition by ; Bali 1928 IV: Music for Temple Festivals and Death Rituals by Allan Evans; Bali 1928 V: Vocal Music in Dance Dramas: Jangér, Arja, Topéng and Cepung from Kedaton, Abian Timbul, Sésétan, Belaluan, Kaliungu and Lombok by Allan Evans; Bali 1928 Anthology: The First Recordings by Allan Evans
Review by: Elizabeth Clendinning
Source: *Ethnomusicology*, Vol. 61, No. 1 (Winter 2017), pp. 166-178
Published by: University of Illinois Press on behalf of Society for Ethnomusicology
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5406/ethnomusicology.61.1.0166
Accessed: 09-02-2017 01:09 UTC

REFERENCES

Recording Reviews

Bali 1928 I: Gamelan Gong Kebyar: Music from Belaluan, Pangkung, Busungbiu: The Oldest New Music of Bali. 2010. Produced and restored by Allan Evans. Notes by Edward Herbst. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2011. One compact disc. Booklet (15 pp.) including photographs.

Bali 1928 II: Tembang Kuna: Songs from an Earlier Time. 2015. Produced and restored by Allan Evans. Notes by Edward Herbst. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2014. One compact disc. Booklet (31 pp.) including photographs.

Bali 1928 III: Lotring and the Sources of Gamelan Tradition. 2015. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2015. One compact disc. Booklet (23 pp.) including photographs.

Bali 1928 IV: Music for Temple Festivals and Death Rituals. 2015. Produced and the restored by Allan Evans. Notes by Edward Herbst. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2016. One compact disc. Booklet (27 pp.) including photographs.

Bali 1928 V: Vocal Music in Dance Dramas: Jangér, Arja, Topéng and Cepung from Kedaton, Abian Timbul, Sésétan, Belaluan, Kaliungu and Lombok. 2015. Produced and restored by Allan Evans. Notes by Edward Herbst. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2017. One compact disc. Booklet (23 pp.) including photographs.

Bali 1928 Anthology: The First Recordings. 2015. Produced and restored by Allan Evans. Notes by Edward Herbst. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2018. One compact disc. Booklet (23 pp.) including photographs.

Series is also released in Indonesia by STIKOM-Bali. Extensive supplementary notes for each volume are available as pdf downloads via http://arbiterrecords.org/catalog/ (English) and www.bali1928.net (Indonesian). Accompanying historical films for the series are also accessible via the project's YouTube channel: https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCZ7RGbz

R8cdHO0dTkuIWNDQ/videos. Further information about the Bali 1928 project can be found at www.edwardherbst.net.

In August 1928, representatives of the German recording companies Odeon and Beka traveled to Bali with the intent of expanding their coverage to include the island. They successfully recorded some one hundred matrices of Balinese music genres, old and new, as performed by some of the most prestigious musicians and music clubs in Bali. However, their attempt to establish an indigenous record market on the island was a commercial failure. The Balinese were more interested in hearing the music live than paying for the expensive technology necessary to play back the musical excerpts, which were limited to three minutes in length. Canadian composer Colin McPhee was the only customer who purchased a set of the 78 r.p.m. discs from one frustrated dealer in the course of a year (Herbst 2010). (This same dealer purportedly destroyed the rest of his stock in a fit of rage.) Today, only a handful of copies of the original audio discs survive.

This audio collection—the first and only commercial release of Balinese music prior to World War II—lies at the heart of the *Bali 1928* project. Coordinated by primary researcher Edward Herbst, Allan Evans at Arbiter Cultural Traditions, and Marlowe Makaradhwaja at STIKOM-Bali, the project pairs 111 re-mastered recordings from the Odeon and Beka releases with silent film footage shot in the 1930s by expatriate artists Colin McPhee, Miguel Covarrubias, and Rolf de Maré. The project also includes contemporaneous photographs taken by Walter Spies, among others. Information drawn from archival research, the testimonies of Balinese musicians, and interviews conducted by dozens of Balinese research consultants while repatriating the restored recordings to their original villages, provides historical and cultural context for the multimedia documentation. The project release comprises five compact discs of music (in Indonesia, also available in cassette format), sixty-two films (in Indonesia, also released on five DVDs), nearly five hundred pages of project notes in English and Indonesian (written by Edward Herbst), as well as project websites in English and Indonesian and a dedicated YouTube channel. A separate single-disc anthology features twenty-five tracks drawn from the series.

As a historical artifact alone, this project is undeniably noteworthy. Of these Odeon and Beka recordings, only eight had been released previously: by Erich M. von Hornbostel on the 1934 recording *Music of the Orient*. (This was re-released in 1951 by Decca, again in 1979 by Smithsonian Folkways, and is currently available to download from the Smithsonian Folkways website.) The other recordings have been largely unavailable to the public, and provide contemporary listeners with the first extensive audio foray into Balinese musical practices of the early twentieth century. In fact, some of these same recordings

inspired McPhee to travel to Bali, where he, along with Jane Belo, Margaret Mead and Gregory Bateson, produced some of the first substantial foreign scholarly work on the Balinese performing arts.

The recordings themselves are also notable for their artistic significance, reflecting a crucial period of development in the modern Balinese musical tradition. The 1920s marked a time of substantial change in Balinese society. Colonization by the Dutch less than two decades earlier led to the dismantling of Bali's kingdoms, causing a simultaneous centralization of political power to the capital and decentralization of artistic power from the courts to the *banjar* (village wards). At the same time, the first waves of Western travelers began to arrive on the island, including expatriate artists and researchers such as McPhee, Covarrubias, de Maré, and Walter Spies. Increased connection within the region resulted in a series of striking artistic developments, including the creation of trans-Malay influenced performance genres, such as *jangér*; renewed interest in classical sung poetry, such as *kakawin*; and the beginning of the meteoric rise of the virtuosic gamelan *gong kebyar*, the gamelan ensemble that would dominate Balinese composition throughout the second half of the twentieth century.

Correspondingly, the five compact discs of the *Bali 1928* project represent an exceptional diversity of genres, including instrumental music for gamelan *gong kebyar, gamelan semar pagulingan, gamelan palégongan, gamelan gendér wayang, gamelan gambang, gamelan pajogédan, gamelan gambuh and gamelan angklung*; the vocal genres of *tembang, kidung* and *kakawin;* the dance genres of *arja, jangér*, and a single recording of *cepung* from Lombok. The individual artists and musical clubs represented here hail from locations across the island; however, the *Bali 1928* researchers suspect that all were connected to Ida Bagus Boda (1870–1965), a renowned dancer and teacher who was able to transcend the politics of inter-group rivalries.

In the case of the more internationally-popular gamelan genres—such as gong kebyar and gender wayang—the *Bali 1928* releases extend the historical and stylistic range of available recordings. For some of the other types of music, particularly the vocal genres, the *Bali 1928* recordings serve as their earliest recorded representations or, sometimes, the only professional recordings available outside of Indonesia. This series also represents a departure from other offerings currently available on the market in that each disc represents a variety of musical genres and regional styles rather than performances from a single artist, ensemble, or musical tradition.

The recordings also convey the linguistic variety that one might expect in any vocal collection of Indonesian traditional performing arts. Sung texts are presented in Common Balinese (Basa Bali Kapara), Old Balinese (Kawi-Bali), Old Javanese (Kawi-Jawa), Middle Javanese (Jawa Tengahan), and Sasak, with some narrative interpretations of poetic and dramatic texts in Refined Balinese

(Basa Bali Alus). Translations of the texts are available in the liner notes in English or in Indonesian, depending on the edition of the recordings.

Each of the five discs is organized thematically, according to musical genre and style, featured performers, recording location and performance context. In this way, each volume is a self-contained selection and can be appreciated individually. *Bali 1928 I: Gamelan Gong Kebyar: Music from Belaluan, Pangkung, Busungbiu* (Indonesian: *Bali 1928, I: Tabuh-Tabuh dari Belaluan, Pangkung, dan Busungbiu*) features early recordings which capture the experimental quality of the nascent *kebyar* genre before it established its modern conventions of form (see Clendinning 2011 for a detailed review of this volume). A radical departure from previous styles when it first appeared on Bali's north coast in the mid-1910s, *kebyar* ("to burst into flame") is best known for its dramatic fluctuations in tempo and volume, its virtuosic sectional passages, and association with daring new dance choreographies. The regional flavors of three of Bali's regions most central to the early development of *kebyar*—northwest Bali, Denpasar, and Tabanan—are represented in this selection. Of particular note is the inclusion of "Kebyar Ding," a highly influential composition that has recently been revived in Bali as a result of this recording project.

Despite their undeniable importance to the history of Balinese music-making, foreign audiences have paid relatively little attention to the sung poetic genres which constitute the second volume, *Bali 1928 II: Tembang Kuna: Songs from an Earlier Time* (Indonesian: *Bali 1928 II: Nyanian dari Masa Lampau*), making this perhaps the most intriguing disc for non-Indonesian listeners. Two-thirds of the tracks are devoted to *tembang*. Often called *puhpuh* ("melodies"), *sekar alit* ("little flower"), or the Javanese *sekar macapat*, *tembang* draws its lyrical material largely from *geguritan* poetry and frequently features themes of unrequited love. The poetic sources for these pieces, where known, range from the fifteenth to the nineteenth centuries.

In tracks 1–4, singer and masked dancer Ida Bagus Oka Kerebuak interprets poetry from the kingdom of Klungkung, a stronghold of poetic and artistic activity in the late nineteenth century. In tracks 5–6, Oka is joined by Ida Boda, who adds traditional comic and philosophical interpretation in the style of a *panasar* (a clown-servant character in *arja* dance opera). Tracks 7–10 are solo *tembang* performances by Ida Boda, including "Adri I," in which Boda's comic intonations are exercised to their full extent in a double entendre-based sexual joke in *tembang* form. The section on *tembang* concludes with tracks 11–14, performed by Ni Dayu Madé Rai, a singer known primarily for *cekér-cekér* (flirtatious songs), singing both solo and accompanied by *suling* (bamboo flute).

Kidung, the "sekar madya" or "middle-sized flower" verse form, most often performed for ritual ceremonies, receives a briefer treatment on the disc, with

a total of four tracks, including one example of *lulungid*-style poetry (a genre known for its textual mystical eroticism, track 15) and two *wargasari* ("bunch of flowers" or "bunch of offerings," tracks 17–18). Here, the voice of Ni Lemon, a *pragina arja* (dancer-actor-singer of *arja*), famous across the island in the 1940s, inflects the sparse texts with nuanced subtlety, stretching each syllable to the utmost extent. *Kakawin*, called "wirama" or "sekar agung" (the "great flower"), are long, narrative poems in Old Javanese with Balinese-language interpretations/commentaries. The four *kakawin* texts presented here are from the Mahabharata and the Ramayana, and the renditions, by Ida Bagus Wayan Buruan and Ida Madé Tianyar of Klungkung, display considerable differentiation in pitch and phrasing. These artistic choices are analyzed thoroughly in the supplemental liner notes.

In this selection, the vocal range of the singers, though less than the western interval of a sixth, contains seven or more distinct tones, serving as an aural reminder that Balinese standardization of pitch and the adaptation of Javanese *sléndro* (five-pitch) and *pélog* (seven-pitch) tuning classifications was a twentieth-century innovation. The high pitch of the vocals relative to those of singers today also provides insight into changing musical aesthetics. As a whole, the style of the vocal genres presented in this volume varies substantially from their current practice. Even for listeners familiar with Balinese music, the contents of this second volume provide a compelling aural experience of the subtleties of Balinese vocal music as it was performed before modern pitch standardization.

The third volume of the series, *Lotring and the* Gamelan *Tradition* (Indonesian: *Lotring dan Sumber-Sumber Tradisi Gamelan*), contains the complete pre-war recordings of I Wayan Lotring (1887–1983). A seminal composer and performer within the transitional Balinese music scene of the early twentieth century, Lotring is known for expanding the conventions of instrumental form and creatively interpreting older idioms within newer ensemble types and musical styles. In addition to his particular mastery of *kendang* (drum) in dance accompaniment, Lotring also played an important role in shaping modern traditions of palégongan, kebyar, gendér wayang, and angklung. Two of these genres—palégongan and gendér *wayang*—are amply represented on this album, comprising fourteen of the twenty-three tracks. The remaining recordings are of semar pagulingan, gambang, and pajogédan (gandrung).

Tracks 1–3 are recordings of gamelan semar pagulingan, the "gamelan of love in the bedchamber," an ensemble traditionally performed for Balinese kings as they took their leisure, and are performed by musicians from Banjar Titih, Denpasar. Track 1 is a *tembang*-inspired composition, while tracks 2 and 3 are derived from the repertoire of the *gambuh* (large flute) ensemble. Despite the relatively low volume of the *kendang* and the lower-pitched instrumental layers, the tone and articulation of the *gangsa* (keyed metallophones) and *trompong*

(kettle-shaped gong chime) are surprisingly clear. Tracks 4–15 are performed by musicians of Banjar Tegal, Kuta, on gamelan *palégongan* and *gendér wayang*. Three of the *palégongan* recordings (tracks 4–6) capture short, dramatically important episodes from the longer, ceremonial Calonarang dance-drama, the source of the shorter, secular Barong-Rangda dance dramas that are presented for tourists in Bali today. The remaining three *palégongan* tracks (7–9) are pieces composed by Lotring that were inspired by other ensemble types: the bamboo xylophones of gamelan gambang (track 7), the bamboo jaw harp génggong, used to imitate frog sounds (track 8), and Central Javanese gamelan repertoire that Lotring heard in Solo (Surakarta), Java at the Mangkunegaran Palace (track 9). The gendér wayang recordings that follow (tracks 10–16), all but one recorded in Banjar Tegal, represent a variety of pieces associated with specific portions of a *wayang* (shadow puppet) performance, including some of Lotring's compositions that were widely disseminated and are performed today, in almost the same versions. The sensitive interpretation of tempo and dynamics accomplished by this quartet of renowned musicians (Lotring, Wayan Raping, Wayan Regog, and one other musician from Banjar Tegal) is compelling, and is captured clearly in the recording.

The remaining examples of Lotring's work are a more mixed selection of genres and musical quality. Track17, the one recording of *palégongan* from the Kelandis club founded by distinguished dancer and musician Nyoman Kalér (1892—1969), shows a direct link to *gambuh* traditions in its prominent use of suling. Unfortunately, the timbre of the instrument has not survived the recording and preservation process particularly well. *Gambang*, a ritual ensemble which includes bamboo xylophones as well as metallophones, is featured in tracks 18–19. Two of these are deemed to be "a mystery" by Herbst, partly because of their erratic performance style. Herbst suggests that the musicians may have been disoriented because they were asked to perform outside of a ceremonial context (a common recording practice of the time). The disc concludes with gamelan *pajogédan* (*gandrung*), a flirtatious dance genre featuring *rindik* (bamboo xylophones). The final track, "Ganderangan," (20), was identified by the researchers as the same version as the one danced by Made Sarin in the silent film accompanying the project. Both video and audio are available together on the Indonesian-release DVD, and on the project's YouTube channel, providing the sole paired audio-visual product of the series.

Together, these recordings showcase Lotring's broad range of expertise and influence within both historical and contemporary performance genres. They also emphasize the mix of regional influences within Lotring's musical world. Though resident in Kuta and primarily active in southern Bali, Lotring's compositional style contains musical influences from across Bali and Java, which are also discussed in the accompanying liner notes. Connections to the writings

of McPhee, also highlighted here, emphasize the importance of Lotring's work not only within a Balinese context, but on an international scale.

The fourth volume, *Music for Temple Festivals and Death Rituals* (Indonesian: *Seni Pertunjukan Upacara*), presents twenty-two recordings performed by gamelan gong kebyar, gamelan angklung, and suling ensembles. For those who have already listened to the first disc of the series, the overall style of tracks 1–8 may seem familiar, as they were also recorded by the Belaluan *gong kebyar* ensemble featured on the first volume, and similarly reflect the group's exuberant *kebyar* style. In this volume, however, the gamelan serves a different function, providing instrumental preludes and interludes for the performance of kakawin and tembang. The singers are I Gejor Kelambu and I Renteg, with I Gejor Gunaksa providing spoken dramatic interpretation. Each track features a single text, including tracks 2–5, which recall events of the Ramayana, and tracks 6–7, which feature stories from the Bharatayudha. The balance between instrumental and vocal portions on each track varies, though each is structurally framed by instrumental material. Herbst notes that the performers' stylistic focus on melody and vocal timbre differs substantially from a more contemporary concern with language and textual meaning—an interesting point of comparison between these and more contemporary kakawin performances.

The Gambuh Sésétan ensemble from Denpasar, featured on tracks 9–11, continues this emphasis on accompanied narrative. Gambuh, considered to be a classical genre in Bali, features stories from the Javanese Majapahit era (thirteenth to fifteenth centuries), in particular tales of the Javanese Prince Panji. The three episodes presented here feature several of the important characters, including Panji, the prince's stepbrother Prabangsa, and a variety of commoners. The line-by-line translation makes it easy to follow the charismatic presentation of the vocals. The instrumental accompaniment is in surprisingly good balance here; gambuh's hallmark instrument, the large suling, is clearly audible, but does not overwhelm the sound, and both gong and drum cycles are distinguishable.

The gambuh tracks are followed by nine recordings of gamelan angklung, a four- or five-tone ensemble used primarily for ceremonies, particularly funerals (tracks 12–20). The instrumentation, tuning, and range of gamelan angklung were still variable at the time of recording, and the three ensembles represented here showcase this diversity. Most notably, the instrumentation of Gamelan Angklung Kléntangan Sidan from Gianyar (tracks 12–15) includes the older *klénténg* (gong-chime). According to the oral history of Sidan presented in the liner notes, the keys of this gamelan, as well as its sound, are believed to be magically powerful and have curative properties. The higher-pitched, sweet-sounding Gamelan Angklung of Pemogan from Denpasar, featured on tracks 12–15, performs compositions by Kaler, who was associated with the ensemble. A single recording of the Gamelan Angklung of Banjar Bun, Denpasar, rounds

out the selection with yet another instrumentation and playing style (track 20). Since the time of these recordings, many angklung ensembles have adopted stylistic elements from the newer gong kebyar style. Here, the repertoire reflects melodic kinship with older styles, and prominently includes musical elements that are associated with angklung, such as the *pangalihan* ("searching") melodic patterns that fall within or outside the *tabuh* (main body of the formal structure of the composition). The instrumental portion of the disc is completed by tracks 21 and 22 featuring suling, and performed by Suling Ubud. The final track, with its four-tone *angklung*-style closing melody, suggests connections between these two instrumental styles.

The contents of this fourth volume emphasize the cross-genre nature of musical innovation at this point in time, and the simultaneous use of both older and newer musical elements. Kebyar is already beginning to take the place of the older gamelan *gong* ensembles and styles in accompanying *kakawin*, influencing the texture, form, and rhythmic density of the overall performance. While three different instrumentations and performance styles within the angklung recordings point to strong regional and even *banjar*-based differences in ritual musical practice, Kaler's tailoring of the Pemogan *angklung* pieces to fit precisely within the recording time constraints suggests an acute awareness of the necessity of adaptation for self-representation to a broader audience.

The fifth and final volume of the series, *Vocal Music in Dance Dramas* (Indonesian: *Nyanian dalam Dramatari: Jangér, Arja, Topéng dan Cepung*) features four different dance drama genres. Each of these genres emerged at the beginning of the twentieth century and exploded in popularity through the following decades. Tracks 1–8 are performances of arja, a modern dance opera genre that emerged from classical gambuh at the turn of the twentieth century. The two featured troupes, from Belaluan and Sesetan, demonstrate the complex constellation of influences shaping the genre's early practice. Originally, both male and female roles were sung by male performers; here, female singers are already participating. The recordings include the small *geguntangan* ensemble (consisting of a pair of drums, a small selection of timekeeping and punctuating gongs, the bamboo slit gong *guntungan*, and sometimes the bamboo *suling* flute) which has since become standard for the genre. Though based on classical poetic styles, many of the *arja* excerpts here present both the texts of the primary singer and the *panasar* (clown servant) sung in Balinese, rather than Old or Middle Javanese with a Balinese interpretation. These dramatic texts largely portray stories from traditional Hindu sources (such as the Mahabharata), with the addition of tracks 1 and 6 which feature parts of the Chinese story of Sampik and Ingtai—perhaps the most popular *arja* tale performed at this time. While the short length of the tracks does not allow for a substantial rendering of any particular drama, the diversity of subjects provides some insight into *arja* practice in this early period.

Jangér is a choral style originating from Abian Timbul and Kedaton, the locations of the thirteen recordings presented here (tracks 9–21). Believed to have originated from recreational drinking songs around 1920, jangér is known for the call-and-response between a female and male chorus, with the female chorus singing lyrics that partially consist of vocables traditional to jangér and the male chorus performing *kecak*, a chanting style derived from trance rituals in which vocables are used to imitate the sound of gamelan. These recordings present a variety of approaches to this basic premise. While several primarily feature the two choruses singing vocables, others include substantial solo or group passages consisting of texts in sung poetic forms such as *pantun*. These poetic inclusions, as well as the humorous and flirtatious performance dance styles highlighted in the corresponding films, were almost certainly influenced by *Komedie Stamboel*, a European-style comedic theater genre from Java, performed in the Malay language. Even with the aid of the translated texts, the comedic associations of jangér are less than obvious from the recordings; nonetheless, the piercing vocal power of lead female vocalists Ni Wayan Pempen and Ni Lemon makes these tracks a compelling entry into the genre.

The ritual masked drama, *topéng*, had been performed in Bali for at least two centuries by the time these recordings were made. The two performances featured here (tracks 23 and 24), by prominent performers Ida Boda, Ida Bagus Rai Purya, and I Nyarikan Seriada, illustrate the continuity of dramatic practice in this experimental artistic period. The re-appearance of Boda, in particular, provides an interesting contrast with his renditions of sung poetry in the second volume. A final notable inclusion in this selection is a recording of cepung (track 22), a genre associated primarily with Muslim Sasak culture in Lombok, though also performed by Hindu Balinese and similar to the Balinese genre *cakepung*. This tale of a beautiful princess betrayed by her sisters is sung in Sasak, and accompanied by *suling* and *rebab* (bowed fiddle). Together, the four genres presented here demonstrate the breadth of dramatic theater activity at this time, as well as suggesting significant artistic interconnection between the different dramatic practices.

In the Indonesian release of this project, each compact disc is packaged with a DVD of the accompanying silent films, all of which are also available online through Bali1928.net and the Bali 1928 YouTube channel. There are sixty-two films in total, ranging in length from under thirty seconds to almost ten minutes, and covering a wide range of subjects: primarily dance lessons, performances, and the preparation and implementation of temple ceremonies, but also two modern demonstrations of Sasak music. While the films do not correspond directly to the audio recordings, and sometimes differ greatly from the repertoire presented on the corresponding audio discs, the collection of films does expand the contextual understanding of the recordings and is compelling in its

own right, providing information regarding instrumentation, musical and dance performance styles, pedagogical norms, and social context. The opportunity to view the performances of some of the most influential dancers of the era as well as see their performance preparations is particularly notable. Photographs from a number of archives and private collections also usefully supplement the other material.

The written information accompanying these audiovisual materials is copious, and as it is dispersed across several locations, is not as easy to navigate as one might have hoped. Basic information about each compact disc, including track listings and durations, streaming audio samples, and acknowledgments, may be found on each disc's webpage on both Arbiter Records and Bali 1928 websites (in English and Indonesian, respectively). The compact disc liner notes for both English and Indonesian releases begin with several pages of discussion of the provenance and historical background of the materials, followed by individual track listings that provide the title of the piece and its translation as well as the name of the recording artist or ensemble. For over half of the vocal tracks, a complete transcription of the original text is paired with its translation into Indonesian or English. Each booklet is peppered with archival photos of featured performers.

For more casual listeners, such as those who have only a passing familiarity with Balinese music, the information in the liner notes is a useful, concise guide to the material on each compact disc. Though its pedagogic scope is limited, the background information provided here is sufficient to convey an appreciation of the content and, perhaps just as importantly, the artistic and historical significance of the project. The line-by-line presentation of the original lyrics and their translation provides a necessary point of entry for non-Balinese listeners into the broad range of languages presented, and the method of indicating where different languages are used within a single track effectively conveys a sense of how multilingualism defines some of the featured art forms. The translations themselves are a fine balance between literal and artistic interpretations. It is important to note, however, that the contents of the liner notes do vary between the English and Indonesian versions. Though some of these differences are subtle, others are more noticeable: for example, song lyrics and translations for every track are printed in the Indonesian version of the liner notes for the fifth volume, but not in the English version (although these are contained in the supplemental notes online).

In fact, the full richness of this project becomes apparent in these supplemental notes written by Herbst, which are available for free download in pdf format from the Arbiter and Bali 1928 websites in English and Indonesian, respectively. Each pdf begins with similar textual material that introduces the history of the Bali 1928 recordings, the scope of the modern re-release project,

and an overview of the time period, before delving into volume-specific material. More extensive explanations of each ensemble and genre type—including typical instrumentation and performance context—are also found here. All of these documents, some of which are over one hundred pages in length, contain historical and theoretical analyses that are substantially expanded from the printed liner notes, in addition to the lyrics and translations not available in some versions of the printed liner notes. Further explanation of both the musical and poetic structures is included, including explanations of text- and music-related conventions. Biographical sketches and photographs of the primary artists provide, in some cases, the most substantive English-language documentation of the artists to date. Though each set of extended notes brings additional historical and theoretical perspectives to the reader's consideration of the recordings, the volume on vocal music is particularly notable for its inclusion of a short treatise on vocal training, practice, aesthetics, and philosophy within broader Balinese Hindu belief.

The inclusion and digital availability of such detailed and thoroughly-researched supplemental notes is one of the distinct advantages of the Bali 1928 series compared to other commercial recordings. This contextualization and integration of information from a wide range of published sources is supported by the commentaries of leading contemporary performing artists. The result is a set of multi-vocal analyses which, while varying in depth and breadth, provide insights likely to be new to Balinese expert performers as well as to less knowledgeable listeners. The sheer diversity of styles presented makes these writings an invaluable resource both for understanding the recordings themselves, and for learning about Balinese performance styles that may be unfamiliar, even to listeners already well-acquainted with other forms of Balinese performing arts.

However, two particular types of listeners may potentially experience difficulty in approaching these recordings due in part to the scope of the supplemental texts. One is the novice of Balinese music, who might be thrown by the surprising number of terms (including "gamelan" and "legong") that are not specifically defined, or are defined in the liner notes some time after their first appearance. Though the supplemental pdf documents provide thorough explanations of all the terminology needed to approach the recordings, the daunting length of these more substantial documents may deter the novice. Because the depth of information varies so greatly between the liner notes and the supplementary notes, even more experienced listeners who seek to understand one specific aspect of the recordings—the basic construction of *tembang*, for example—may be overwhelmed by the scope of information presented in the long-form notes. The dispersal of the supplementary information in so many different locations, as well as the slight differences in level of detail between texts

that otherwise appear similar, may also prove problematic for a listener seeking to answer particular questions about a genre or a specific recording.

Despite being arguably as historically significant as the audio tracks presented in the *Bali 1928* collection, the associated film material receives comparatively little attention in the supplementary notes, except in its relationship to specific tracks or performers. Though the films are listed by title, performer, filmmaker, and date in each set of supplemental notes for the English-language publication of *Bali 1928*, the amount of additional detail varies from film to film. The only mention of the films on the Arbiter Records website is a link to the Bali 1928 YouTube channel, which masks some of their potential as rich accompaniments to the listening experience. The YouTube summaries also involve only a few sentences on the historical and stylistic context of each film (these are also found on the Indonesian-language Bali1928.net webpage). Since the audio and video are equally rare historical artifacts, it is puzzling that such a wealth of analytical attention would be paid to the music and so little to the visual. Given the long-term scope and collaborative nature of the project, as well as the primarily online presentation of this material, it would surely be feasible, and certainly enlightening to the viewer, for a future phase of the project to involve further contextualization of these historically and ethnographically rich films.

On balance, *Bali 1928* is a treasure trove for both scholars and practitioners of the Balinese performing arts, providing general access to a monumental collection of formerly inaccessible audio recordings and films from one of the most dynamic periods of Balinese musical history. The repatriation process and subsequent publication of these materials has already sparked artistic and scholastic discussions in Bali and beyond, a promising starting point for the ongoing use of this collection as an integral component of both artistic revivals and reinterpretations, as well as theoretical and scholarly analyses. The diversity of genres and styles provides ample choices for any listener interested in Balinese performing arts. Listeners accustomed to the aural quirks of historical recordings will also note the impressive clarity, balance, and immediacy of the sound, relative to other recordings of a similar vintage. Those with a broader interest in the Indonesian performing arts, Indonesian history, or the Indonesian languages and their poetic traditions will also find much of interest, thanks especially to the extensive translations and careful contextualization of the texts.

Paired with more recent recordings, the audio and visual content would be a logical pedagogical choice to increase understanding of style and genre within courses on Indonesian or Southeast Asian music, as well as in Balinese music or dance ensembles. World music, world dance, or Southeast Asian history students at the introductory level would likely benefit most from the film content, which is approachable and engaging, even for those with little prior knowledge of the

Balinese performing arts. Given that the project methodology included archival and ethnographic research, audiovisual preservation, and audiovisual repatriation, the *Bali 1928* series as a whole provides a compelling subject for analysis for students and more experienced scholars alike who are interested in pursuing transnational, collaborative projects that bring musical histories into the present. Finally, it is clear to this reviewer that the recordings are already serving what is perhaps their most important purpose: as a point of artistic inspiration and site of cultural memory within Balinese artistic communities. With the release of this collection of recordings, this important cultural heritage is now available to new generations of listeners, both within Bali and around the world.

References

Clendinning, E. 2011. Review of *Bali 1928 I:* Gamelan *Gong Kebyar: Music from Belaluan, Pangkung, Busung-biu: The Oldest New Music of Bali*. 2010. Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2011. *Ethnomusicology* 55(1): 179–80.

Herbst, Edward. 2010. Liner notes for *Bali 1928 I:* Gamelan *Gong Kebyar: Music from Belaluan, Pangkung, Busung-biu: The Oldest New Music of Bali.* Arbiter Record Company, World Arbiter 2011.

Elizabeth Clendinning Wake Forest University

Pajod—Lyydiläisiä lauluja / Ludian Songs. 2007. Piť k Randaane Choir. CD and booklet. Recorded by Kari Hakala and Ilpo Saastamoinen in 2003. Ludian lyrics translated into Finnish by Miikul Pahomov. Poems translated into English from the Finnish translations by Veli Väisänen and Nicholas Mayow. Notes by Tarja von Creutlein. Booklet edited by Obraman Fed'uun Miikul, Produced by Jaana-Maria Jukkara. Maailman musiikin keskus / Global Music Centre and Lyydiläinen seura ry/Ludian Association in Finland.

The Ludian people are a small linguistic group in the eastern parts of the Republic of Karelia, in Russia. Their language, Ludian (Lüüdin kiel'), is often described as transitional, between Vepsian and Livvi-Karelian (Olonets Karelian), and is considered to be either a dialect of Karelian or a separate language. Fifty years ago, it was spoken as a native language by 6000–7000 people, but it is now threatened with extinction, with the number of Ludic speakers estimated to be around one hundred.

Therefore this collection of Ludian songs (the first published audio disc of Ludian music) is a timely mark of respect to this cultural group. Russia has changed so rapidly in the last twenty years, that almost any documentation of the culture of ordinary people is valuable. The songs that were sung just recently